

**APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE
OPEN SESSION MEETING MINUTES
MAY 21, 2013**

LOCATION: Office of the Comptroller of the Currency, 400 7th Street SW, Washington, DC 20024.

ATTENDEES

ASC MEMBERS: OCC – Darrin Benhart (Acting Chair)
CFPB – Mira Marshall
FDIC – Rae-Ann Miller
FHFA – Susan Cooper
FRB – Art Lindo
HUD – Ada Bohorfoush
NCUA – Joy Lee

ASC STAFF: Executive Director – Jim Park
Deputy Executive Director – Denise Graves
General Counsel – Alice Ritter
Attorney-Advisor – Dan Rhoads
Regulatory Affairs Specialist – Claire Brooks
Management & Program Analyst – Lori Schuster
Administrative Assistant – Brian Kelly

OBSERVERS: Appraisal Foundation – David Bunton
Appraisal Foundation – Paula Douglas Seidel
Appraisal Institute – Rick Borges
Appraisal Institute – Lance Coyle
Appraisal Institute – Bill Garber
Appraisal Institute – Brian Rodgers
Appraisal Institute – Sara Stephens
FDIC – Suzy Gardner
FRB – Ginny Gibbs
FRB – Kevin Wilson
OCC – Bob Parson

The Meeting was called to order at 10:35 a.m. by D. Benhart. J. Lee attended via telephone.

<OPEN SESSION>

1. Opening Remarks

D. Benhart welcomed the observers to the Meeting.

J. Park reported on ASC staff activities since the ASC's April 10th meeting. He and D. Graves monitored the Appraisal Practices Board (APB) meeting in Austin, TX held on April 25-26. The APB is developing several Valuation Advisories pertaining to: Comparable Sales; Comparable Properties for Automated Valuation and Mass Appraisal Models; Collection and Verification of Residential and non-Residential Sales Data; and Measurement and Application of Market Participant Acquisitions Premiums. The APB is also working on Advisories relating to the valuation of commercial and residential "green" buildings. Several ASC staff attended the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials Spring Conference April 27-29 in Austin, TX. There were 144 State regulators representing 29 States in attendance. Staff gave presentations covering recent ASC activities, the Hotline and the proposed Policy Statements. J. Park attended the Appraiser Qualifications Board meeting in Charlotte, NC May 2-3. The discussion focused on various questions and concerns that States and others have regarding the *2015 Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria*. On other matters, he reported that the Appraisal Complaint National Hotline, which opened on March 15th, is running smoothly. He noted the agreed upon procedures review report of the 2012 Appraisal Foundation grant identified no areas where the Appraisal Foundation's use of grant funds was outside the grant agreement. D. Bunton updated the ASC on the State Appraiser Investigation courses and noted that over 500 persons have taken the courses since its inception in 2008. D. Benhart asked when the 2012 ASC Annual Report would be ready for an ASC vote. J. Park said it should be distributed to the ASC for a notational vote in 2-3 weeks.

2. Summary Agenda

- **April 10, 2013 minutes – Open Session**

M. Marshall made a motion to approve the April 10th open session meeting minutes as presented. A. Bohorfoush seconded and all members present voted to approve.

3. Discussion Agenda

- **Revised ASC Policy Statements**

A. Ritter presented the Revised Policy Statements and noted that edits were made based on comments received from interested parties. D. Benhart asked if Compliance Reviews conducted after June 1st will follow the revised Policy Statements should the ASC approve them today and A. Ritter responded "yes." A.

Lindo questioned whether a Poor rating on a State can disqualify that State's appraisers from reciprocity. A. Ritter answered "yes." R. Miller asked how State A would know whether State B's credentialing requirements meet or exceed their credentialing requirements. A. Ritter answered that State A would need to review the laws and requirements in State B to make that determination, and added that a State may always have a more "open door" policy. ASC staff clarified that Compliance Review Findings are available on the ASC website for States to ensure that a State is "in compliance" for purposes of reciprocity. A. Bohorfoush moved to approve the Policy Statements as presented with an effective date of June 1, 2013. S. Cooper seconded and all members present voted to approve.

- **Appraisal Foundation January 2013 Grant Reimbursement Request**

J. Park presented the January 2013 Grant Reimbursement Request in the amount of \$44,144. R. Miller moved to approve the Request as presented. A. Lindo seconded and all members present voted to approve.

- **Vermont Compliance Review**

D. Graves presented the Vermont Compliance Review Report and letter. Vermont was found to be "Not in Substantial Compliance" with Title XI. ASC staff recommends retaining Vermont on a two-year Review Cycle with off-site monitoring. M. Marshall moved to approve the Vermont Compliance Review Report and letter. R. Miller seconded and all members present voted to approve.

The Open Session adjourned at 11:00 a.m. into Closed Session and the observers left the Meeting. The next scheduled Meeting is for June 12, 2013.