

**APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE  
OPEN SESSION MEETING MINUTES  
MARCH 14, 2012**

LOCATION: Office of the Comptroller of the Currency, 250 E Street SW, Room 8C,  
Washington, DC 20219.

**ATTENDEES**

**ASC MEMBERS:** CFPB – Paul Sanford  
FDIC – Doreen Eberley  
FHFA – Susan Cooper (Alternate)  
FRB – Art Lindo  
HUD – Pete Gillispie (Acting Chair)  
NCUA – Joy Lee  
OCC – Darrin Benhart

**ASC STAFF:** Executive Director – Jim Park  
Deputy Executive Director – Denise Graves  
General Counsel – Alice Ritter  
Administrative Officer – Claire Brooks  
Administrative Officer – Lori Schuster  
Policy Manager – Vicki Metcalf  
Policy Manager – Jenny Tidwell

**OBSERVERS:** Cathy Johnson – Appraisal Foundation  
Brian Rodgers - Appraisal Institute  
George Parkerson – FDIC  
Virginia Gibbs – FRB  
Kevin Wilson – FRB  
Robert Parson - OCC  
Penny Reed - Wells Fargo Bank

The meeting was called to order at 10:35 a.m. by P. Gillispie. D. Eberley, J. Lee, S. Cooper and G. Parkerson were present on the telephone.

**<OPEN SESSION>**

**1. Opening Remarks**

P. Gillispie welcomed the observers to the meeting.

J. Park reported on ASC staff activities including an update on staffing changes, the Appraisal Complaint National Hotline, and ASC Policy Statement revisions.

## 2. **Summary Agenda**

- **Notation vote for response letter to Congress on GAO Report** – The notation vote for the response letter to Congress on the GAO Report passed with a 7-0 vote on March 9<sup>th</sup>.

- **February 8, 2012 minutes – Open Session**

D. Benhart made a motion to move the February 8<sup>th</sup> open session meeting minutes to the Discussion Agenda. A. Lindo seconded and all members present voted to approve.

## 3. **Discussion Agenda**

- **February 8, 2012 minutes – Open Session**

D. Benhart suggested a revision to the minutes to clarify the timeframe for the 2012 Appraisal Foundation grant. D. Benhart moved to approve the February 8<sup>th</sup> Open Session meeting minutes. P. Sanford seconded and all members present voted to approve.

- **Appraisal Foundation September – November 2011 grant reimbursement requests**

J. Park presented the September – November 2011 grant reimbursement requests. D. Eberley asked that supporting documentation for equipment rental be included in future grant reimbursement requests. A. Lindo inquired as to whether ASC staff could determine whether or not attendance by States at the State Investigator Training courses has improved those State's enforcement programs. C. Johnson from the Appraisal Foundation said she could send ASC staff a listing of States who have attended the courses. After further discussion, A. Lindo moved for approval of the September, October, and November grant reimbursement requests in the amounts of \$126,021, \$123,916, and \$66,500, respectively. D. Benhart seconded and all members present voted to approve.

- **Revised ASC Delegations of Authority**

J. Park presented a proposal to amend the ASC Delegations of Authority. ASC staff believes the proposed changes would allow ASC members to focus on States which pose more risk to the system. It would also improve turnaround time on many Reviews by 30 to 60 days. S. Cooper asked staff to define a serious area of

concern. J. Park responded it is a judgment call made by ASC staff during the Compliance Review. D. Graves added a serious area of concern could also be an issue that has been referenced on previous Reviews with no corrective actions taken by the State. There was also a discussion on what issues would put a State in a one-year versus two-year Review Cycle. D. Benhart suggested the ASC Chairman have the authority to delegate signatory approval to the Vice Chair or Executive Director when a Compliance Report has a finding of In Substantial Compliance. Some ASC members suggested delegating Compliance Reviews that are found to be In Substantial Compliance to the ASC Chairman with a copy of all signed Reports and letters sent to ASC members so they are aware of what has been completed. There was discussion on the timeline of State Reviews. J. Park noted that currently Compliance Reviews are discussed in closed session at one meeting and then approved by the ASC at the following meeting. P. Sanford made a motion to revise the Delegations of Authority giving the ASC Chairman authority to re-delegate signatory authority to the Executive Director when a State is found to be In Substantial Compliance. D. Benhart seconded and all members present voted to approve. The ASC Acting Chairman confirmed this new delegation of authority will take effect immediately.

- **Compliance Reviews (Hawaii, Montana, Nebraska, New Mexico, New York, Wisconsin)**

D. Graves summarized the findings of the State Compliance Reviews. She added that Hawaii, Montana, New York, and Wisconsin were not found to be in substantial compliance. Nebraska and New Mexico were found to be in substantial compliance, and delegated for signature without ASC approval. D. Eberley moved to approve the Hawaii, Montana, New York, and Wisconsin Compliance Reviews and letters and delegate authority to the ASC Acting Chairman to review and sign the letters. A. Lindo seconded and all members present voted to approve.

The Open Session adjourned at 11:40 a.m. into Closed Session. The observers left the meeting. S. Cooper also left the meeting. The next scheduled meeting is for April 11, 2012.